

# COUNSELING AND ETHICS, MANAGING CASELOADS AND DIFFICULT CONVERSATIONS

Rick Merson, PhD

Beaumont Health System, Inc

Oakland University William Beaumont  
School of Medicine

# Belmont Report

## National Comm. Protection Human Subjects

- ▣ 1. Respect and dignity in treating individuals
- ▣ 2. Beneficence: DO NO HARM
- ▣ 3. Justice: Ensure reasonable and non-exploitative procedures.

# Tudor Study Analysis

- ▣ Ambrose, PhD Yairi, PhD
- ▣ American Journal of Speech-Language Pathology ( 11) Pp. 190-203, 2002.
- “The Tudor Study: Data & Ethics”
- ▣ Robert Goldfarb, PhD Adelphi Univ.
- ▣ Plural Publ. (2006)
- “A Case Study in Fluency”

# Ethical Issues

- ▣ Do No Harm
- ▣ Informed Consent
- ▣ Exploitation of Vulnerable Persons
- ▣ Justifiable Conclusions
- ▣ Privacy of Participants
- ▣ Exploitative Journalism
- ▣ Ethical Standards of the Day

# An Experimental Study of the Effect of Evaluative Labeling on Speech Fluency

- ▣ Master's Thesis: Mary Tudor , 1939
- ▣ Wendell Johnson, PhD ,University of Iowa, Supervisor
- ▣ Test : **Diagnosogenic Theory of Stuttering**
- ▣ Soldiers & Sailors Orphan's Home, Davenport, Iowa
- ▣ Screened 256 residents, N: 10 PWS, 12 Controls
- ▣ 5 to 16 years of age

# Four Experimental Groups

## ▣ Judged to Stutter

- ▣ Group 1A told, “they were not stutterers”
- ▣ Group 1B told, “they did stutter”.
- ▣ Both groups received treatment.

## ▣ Judged to be Fluent

- ▣ Group 2 A told, “they were not stutterers”
- ▣ Group 2 B, told, “they did stutter.”
- ▣ Both groups received treatment.

# Mean Judges Severity Rating

Groups	Before & After Rx	
□ Group 1 A <b>Stu</b> /Labeled <u>Normal</u>	3.02 (1.18)	2.92 (.82)
□ Group 1 B <b>Stu</b> /Labeled <u>Stu</u>	2.62(.64)	2.80(.75)
□ Group 2 A <u>Norm</u> Labeled <b>Stu</b>	2.83(.24)	2.92(.68)
□ Group 2 B <u>Norm</u> Labeled <u>Norm</u>	2.88(.44)	2.92(.23)
	<b><u>No Stat.Differences !</u></b>	

# Conclusions

- ▣ Mary Tudor concluded that stuttering was established as a result of the study methods.
- ▣ These conclusions are not supported by the data!!!!!!
- ▣ There were no differences in judged fluency by virtue of labeling the children as stutterers.

# The Immortal Life of Henrietta Lacks”

## Rebecca Skloot

### 2010

- ▣ African American Woman died of Cervical Cancer. ( 1951, 31 y)
- ▣ Her cancer cells were duplicated to be used in future experiments.
- ▣ No Consent
- ▣ No Recognition/Dignity
- ▣ No compensation
- ▣ Large Monetary Value
- ▣ Hela Cells
- ▣ Thousands of Experiments; Polio, Aids, Gene Mapping
- ▣ Cancer Treatments
- ▣ Substantial International Medical Benefit
- ▣ Skloot (2010) HLMF